

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA  
CIVIL ACTION NO.: 1:21-CV-00590

MATTHEW BRUEHL, M.D.,

Plaintiff,

v.

DUKE UNIVERSITY, DUKE  
UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF  
MEDICINE, DUKE UNIVERSITY  
HEALTH SYSTEM, INC., and  
PRIVATE DIAGNOSTIC CLINIC,  
PLLC,

Defendants.

**JOINT STIPULATION TO  
ELECTRONIC SERVICE OF  
DOCUMENTS**

Pursuant to Rule 5(b)(2)(E) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and by and through their undersigned attorneys, Plaintiff Matthew Bruehl, M.D., and Defendants Duke University and Private Diagnostic Clinic, PLLC, hereby agree and stipulate that any document required to be served pursuant to Rule 5(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, but which is not submitted for filing using the Court's Case Management/Electronic Case Filing system (CM/ECF), shall be considered properly served on a party if the document is sent by electronic mail to counsel for that party using the e-mail address designated in each counsel's signature below.

The following conditions shall apply:

- (1) Service of a document will be considered effective as of a particular date if the email attaching the document is transmitted to the recipient's email server by 11:59 p.m. EST on that date.

- (2) If the sender receives notification that a message was not delivered to the recipient, the document will not be considered served until: (1) the message is re-sent and a notice of delivery failure is not received; or (2) the document is transmitted by other means allowed pursuant to Rule 5;
- (3) If a party wishes to serve a document with a file size too large to be transmitted by the sender's email server or accepted by the recipient's email server, the party may serve the document by making the file available for download on a file-sharing site and emailing a link that may be used by the recipient to access and download the document.
- (4) If any party wishes to change the email address designated for receipt of electronic service of documents pursuant to this stipulation, they shall circulate written notice of the changed email address to all parties at the email addresses designated below.
- (5) This stipulation is effective as of the date below.

This the 1st day of September 2021.

FORREST FIRM, P.C.

/s/ VALERIE BATEMAN

Valerie Bateman, N.C. Bar No. 13417  
Rachel M. Blunk, N.C. Bar No. 42694  
406 Blackwell St., Suite 420  
Durham, North Carolina 27701  
Tel/Fax: (919) 436-3592  
Email: valerie.bateman@forrestfirm.com  
Email: rachel.blunk@forrestfirm.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff*

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH,  
SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.

/s/ Michael B. Cohen

Robert A. Sar, N.C. Bar No. 22306  
Michael B. Cohen, N.C. Bar No. 50629  
8529 Six Forks Road, Forum IV, Suite  
600  
Raleigh, North Carolina 27615  
Telephone: 919.787.9700  
Facsimile: 919.783.9412  
E-mail: bob.sar@ogletree.com  
E-mail: michael.cohen@ogletree.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Duke University*

MOORE & VAN ALLEN PLLC

/s/ John A. Zaloom

John A. Zaloom, N.C. Bar No. 30557

100 North Tryon Street, Suite 4700

Charlotte, North Carolina 28202

Telephone: 919-286-8182

E-mail: johnzaloom@mvalaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Private  
Diagnostic Clinic, PLLC*

48412833.1